

TITLE: STRUCTURED ACADEMIC CONTROVERSY (SAC)
WHAT IS THE BEST SOLUTION FOR NORTH AND SOUTH KOREA REUNIFICATION?

AUTHOR: Mrs. Lea Heredia

GRADES: 11th

TOPIC/THEME: Social Science: Korean War Resolution

TIME REQUIRED: One Block Period: 1hr & 45 minutes, OR Two Regular 60 minute periods.

BACKGROUND: Students will have examined and already demonstrated knowledge of the causes of the Korean War and the stalemate reached that has continued to result in the division of Korea. Students will have an understanding of Korea's part in the Cold War between the United States and the Soviet Union. Students will now examine possible solutions that do not include the U.S. or Soviet Union and whether it is possible for the two countries to negotiate reunification independently.

CURRICULUM CONNECTION: This lesson will provide students with the opportunity to work with geopolitical policies and the consequences of policies that were a result of United States Cold War and current foreign policies. Directly relates to California Social Science Standard 11.9.3 and the CA Literacy Content Standard 2b.

CONNECTION TO STUDENTS' LIVES: This lesson will give students skills in complex conflict resolution and compromise. It will also allow them to see the caliber of critical thinking their peers are engaging in at the college level. Students learn to develop claims and counter claims to modern conflicts.

OBJECTIVES:

1. Students will analyze three possible solutions to North and South Korea Reunification using essays written by South Korean college students.
2. Students will examine each proposed solutions practicality and effectiveness.
3. Students will formulate a consensus about the best solution and provide reasons for their argument.
4. Students will demonstrate their knowledge of the context of the North and South Korean conflict and the complexity of resolving reunification.

NATIONAL AND STATE STANDARDS:

NCSS Standard: Learner Expectations: help learners to identify issues and problems in the past, recognize factors contributing to such problems, identify and analyze alternative courses of action, formulate a position or course of action, and evaluate the implementation of that decision.

CA Standard – 11.9.3: Trace the origins and geopolitical consequences (foreign and domestic) of the Cold War and containment policy, including the following: The Korean War

Common Core Standards:

WHST 1 Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content

WHST 4 Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization and style are appropriate to task, purpose and audience

WHST 9 Draw evidence form informational texts to support analysis, reflection and research

SL 1 Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions

RH 6 Evaluate authors' differing points of view on the same historical event or issues

MATERIALS REQUIRED:

1. North and South Korea Negotiation Timeline
2. Essay #1: Document A: The Solution to North and South Korea Reunification
3. Essay #2: Document B: The Road to Reunification Begins in Gaeseoung
4. Essay #3: Document C: First Step to Reunify: Involve the Young
5. Handout #1: Summarizing and Comparing the Solutions
6. Handout #2: Coming to a Consensus: What is the Best Solution to North and South Korea Reunification?

INTRODUCTION: Students will have a strong foundation in the causes and events of the Korean War. This lesson focuses on understanding the long term and ongoing consequences of the Cold War and United States foreign policy. Using students' knowledge of North Korea's chosen command economy and South Korea's market economy as well as the economic dependence and political ties to Communist China, the former Soviet Union and the United States, students will explore the complexities of diplomatic negotiations between two countries who endure the consequences of World War II and Cold War policies. As of yet, the history of North and South Korea diplomacy has failed and intervention from the U.S., China, and the Soviet Union seems to have only complicated matters. After reviewing a timeline that highlights the most important events in the ongoing negotiations for reunification of North and South Korea, students will analyze fresh perspectives and solutions offered by South Korean University students. With the ideas of their peers, students will look at the conflict with an open mind and a twenty-first century point of view un-jaded by failures of past generations.

PROCEDURE:

THE DELIVERY OF THE CONTENT:

1. Students will be briefed on the currently stalled negotiations between South and North Korea by a review of the Korean Negotiations Timeline. (See attached)
2. Students will be briefed on the *Korea Times* newspaper's national essay competition among university students in South Korea and the prompt searching for new, fresh perspectives and solutions to Korean reunification. (See websites:
http://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/events/EssayContest_NK_110109/EssayContest_NK_110109.asp
http://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/news/nation/2011/05/113_87110.html)
3. Students will be prompted to answer the central question:
 - What is the best solution for North and South Korean reunification?
4. Students will pair share their answers.
5. Students will then be given the first essay to read. (See attached Essay #1 Document A)
6. Students will be given Handout #1 and asked to fill in the graphic organizer. Teacher may model the first questions. Teacher may need to explain what a historical hypothesis is and how to answer the hypothesis questions on the handout. (See attached Handout #1 Summarizing and Comparing the Solutions)
7. Students will be given essays number two (Document B) and essay number 3 (Document C) and asked to answer the questions listed in the graphic organizer.
8. Teacher may want to sample student's responses and use as examples to flesh out class answers.
9. Students are then given Handout #2 (See attached Handout #2 Coming to a Consensus)
10. Students are instructed to "Come to a Consensus". Having read three possible solutions for reunification they need to choose the best solution. They can either choose one of the author's solutions OR can formulate their own solution using a hybrid of solutions from two or all three essays. Both choices must outline an argument using evidence from the essay/s, AND from their own knowledge of the North and South Korean conflict learned in class. Students need to be sure to explain in detail why they believe this solution is better than any other.

THE APPLICATION OF THE CONTENT: Students will be able to apply their newly acquired skills in conflict mediation and solution in all academic areas of study. The ability to evaluate proposals and apply sound judgment using qualitative and objective reasoning is a skill all students can use in a variety of assessments and

applications. By applying a formula of close reading and corroboration to sources in history, students can have better access to the “unpacking” of history standards. Students will be able to organize their critical thinking skills while learning additional content.

ASSESSMENT: Students’ prior knowledge will be assessed through the central question implemented in the beginning and then at the end of the lesson. Students will access prior content knowledge reviewing the *Korean Negotiations Timeline*. Students will apply their prior learned content knowledge and skills accessing documents in the *Summarizing and Comparing the Solutions Handout* by organizing, summarizing, evaluating, comparing, and then hypothesizing each essay. In the *Come to a Consensus Handout* students apply and demonstrate their prior knowledge of Cold War foreign policy, corroboration of all three essay’s proposed solutions, their own compromise and creative thinking skills by combining all content knowledge to be used in answering the central question: *What is the best solution for North and South Korea reunification?*

RESOURCES:

1. Korea Times 2011 Essay Contest:
http://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/events/EssayContest_NK_110109/EssayContest_NK_110109.asp
2. Korea Times Essay Contest Winners:
http://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/news/nation/2011/05/113_87110.html

Korean Negotiations Timeline

27 July 1953

The war ends when a truce is signed by a representative of the US-backed UN forces and a representative of North Korea and allied Chinese forces. South Korea was not a signatory. There is no formal peace treaty, meaning the two countries remain technically at war. The Korean War cost 2 million lives.

January 1968

North Korean commandos launch a failed assassination attempt on the then president of South Korea, Park Chung-hee.

15 August 1974

There is another assassination attempt on Park Chung-hee, by a North Korean agent in Seoul. Park survives, but the first lady is killed.

9 October 1983

North Korean agents target the venue of a visit by South Korean president Chun Doo-hwan to Burma, killing more than 20 people including four South Korean cabinet ministers. The president escapes.

29 November 1987

North Korea blows up a South Korean civilian airliner, killing 115 people. The US decides to include the North on its list of countries that support terrorism.

1991

North and South Korea become members of the UN.

June 2000

North Korean leader Kim Jong-il and South Korean president Kim Dae-jung meet in Pyongyang.

February 2005

North Korea claims to have built nuclear weapons.

July 2006

North Korea test-fires medium- and long-range missiles.

9 October 2006

An international outcry follows North Korea's first nuclear test, and the UN sets up a series of sanctions.

November 2007

The prime ministers of the two Koreas meet for the first time in 15 years.

April 2009

North Korea launches a long-range rocket capable of carrying a nuclear warhead. Criticism from the UN Security Council prompts Kim Jong-il to walk out of talks aimed at ending North Korea's nuclear program.

May 2009

North Korea announces it has successfully conducted a second nuclear test, sparking an emergency meeting of the UN Security Council. It also withdraws from the 1953 armistice that ended the war between the two Koreas.

March 2010

The South Korean warship Cheonan sinks after an unexplained explosion; 46 sailors die.

A later investigation suggests the boat was sunk by a torpedo launched from a North Korean submarine.

September 2010

Kim Jong-un, Kim Jong-il's youngest son, gains high-powered political and military posts, fuelling speculation that he will be his father's successor.

23 November 2010

The North fires rounds of artillery on to an inhabited South Korean border island. South Korea scrambles its fighter jets and returns fire, saying two of its marines have been killed.

DOCUMENT A:

A SOLUTION TO NORTH & SOUTH KOREA REUNIFICATION (MODIFIED)

Since the division of Korea in August 1945, Koreans on both sides of the 38th parallel have desired a unified nation. But despite an increasingly empathetic view toward the North, an alarming number of South Koreans are of the view that reunification is “unnecessary.”

The Korean youth who will soon be deciding the political direction of their country represent a generation that has no ties to the North.

They do not know or remember a unified Korea outside of what they were taught in history books. They have no tangible family links to the North, other than what they hear from their grandparents.

Now that South Korea is becoming an international economic powerhouse, many South Koreans fear the economic burden that reunification would place on their shoulders. As a result, the realistic possibility of a reunified Korea is becoming something of a dream.

The best way to generate this kind of internal dialogue is to agree to the North Korean proposal to trade food provisions for family reunions. If North Korea agrees to increased food distribution monitoring, South Korea should offer one ton of food for every reunited family. This arrangement will nurture a sense of hope, promote peace, and build cooperation on both sides of the DMZ.

A conversation will resonate throughout the whole peninsula, renewing the feeling of unity that is slowly losing its place in the hearts and minds of young South Koreans.

The longer the Korean peninsula is divided, the more the idea of reunification will fall in South Korean public opinion. The South is doing exceptionally well economically. Reunification would not come without a heavy cost; however, increasing trade and exchanging food for family reunions is a win-win situation.

For the North, a starving population will be fed. For the South, peace and cooperation in the short term and the groundwork for reunification in the future will be established. If South Korean leaders are really committed to a unified Korea, they need to promote the idea and its advantages to the Korean people. If South Korea does not want reunification, no one else will either.

Source: The Korea Times National Edition: 05-16-2011 North Korea Essay Contest Winner : By Trae Douglas Turner. http://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/news/nation/2011/05/113_87110.html

DOCUMENT B:

ROAD TO REUNIFICATION BEGINS IN GAESEONG (MODIFIED)

Any discussion of a lasting peace on the Korean peninsula must include reunification as not just a desirable but also as an essential solution to current problems. There are two paths to reunification: through peaceful diplomacy or military action. Peaceful reunification with the North is preferable, but under what terms and through which venues should reunification dialogue be conducted? It is clear what the major obstacles are that need to be addressed: the North Korean nuclear weapons program and the obsolete inefficient North Korean economic system.

What should be the topic of discussion? The answer lies in the Gaeseong Industrial Complex (GIC). (An agreement reached in 2003 between the North and South Korean governments to allow factories run by South Korean companies who employ North Korean workers in a small area on the North and South Korea border.)

The GIC shows that North and South are capable of working together to create projects that can withstand the volatility of international diplomacy. In holding future talks with the North, Seoul should use Gaesong as a blueprint in creating other economically viable projects, which can contribute to the economic development of North Korea and bring the two sides closer together. If the North and South become more economically invested in each other, the possibility of incidents as occurred in the past year will naturally diminish. The hard truth is that Seoul has little control over how the United States or China will act with regard to North Korea, and it is in the best interest of South Korea to come up with realistic, mutually beneficial economic projects that will make state violence in the short term less likely and lessen the financial burden of reunification in the long term.

Source: The Korea Times National Edition: 05-16-2011 North Korea Essay Contest Winner, Commendation

Prize: By Park Tae-jin http://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/news/nation/2011/05/113_87110.html

DOCUMENT C:

FIRST STEP TO REUNIFY: INVOLVE THE YOUNG (MODIFIED)

Since the post-Soviet great famine in North Korea in 1996 to 1999, the North has desperately pursued a “military first” policy at the expense of its people’s welfare. Meanwhile, the South enjoys a robust capitalist economy combined with the values of liberal democracy and hard work.

Reunification is something that will involve young people. South Korean youth should be ready for the possibility of one Korea in the coming years. Almost two generations of Koreans have lived with the social and political reality that there are two Koreas. Many young people today no longer care about the importance of reclaiming national history.

Perhaps it is time that the young people of South Korea learn to accept that the two Koreas will someday become one and that their brothers and sisters in the North are their equals. While South Korean leaders should prepare the way for eventual reunification, reunification does not belong to current leadership. It belongs to those who will inherit the future of Korea. Therefore, the leaders of today should do everything they can to dissolve indifference among youth. The sense of shared history and a culture of involvement should be nurtured in the minds and hearts of the young people of South Korea.

The government of South Korea should invest in all levels of talks — from military to political, from academic to youth exchanges, to foster a culture of dialogue and avoid deadly military clashes in the future. Bilateral dialogue should be constantly undertaken, even without preconditions. Furthermore, the international community should do everything at its disposal to prevent the development of nuclear weapons on the Korean peninsula. The North should not be allowed to possess any weapon of mass destruction. That way, when the inevitable collapse happens, there will be no impending nuclear war, only the task of rebuilding the North and reuniting people divided by ideologies, separated by systems.

Fundamentally, South Korean youth should not be alienated in talks toward national reunification. Indifference can have no place in the minds and hearts of young people, since it is obvious that reunification is not something the current leaders of South Korea will make. The old generation is there to prepare the way. The young generation, those who will shape tomorrow, will continue this great story. It is theirs to make.

Source: The Korea Times National Edition: 05-16-2011 North Korea Essay Contest Winner, Commendation Prize: By Manuel Sistosso http://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/news/nation/2011/05/113_87110.html

WHAT IS THE BEST SOLUTION TO NORTH AND SOUTH REUNIFICATION?

Summarize and compare each student's essay.

DOCUMENT A: <u>The Solution to North and South Korea Reunification</u>	SUMMARIZE: What is the author's proposed solution/s?	CLOSE READING: Why does the author believe this is the best solution?
HYPOTHESIS 1: Do you believe this solution is the best to N&S reunification? Why or why not? <i>Use your background knowledge of the Korean conflict as well as the timeline to strengthen your argument.</i>		
DOCUMENT B: <u>The Road to Reunification Begins in Gaesöung</u>	SUMMARIZE: What is the author's proposed solution/s?	CLOSE READING: Why does the author believe this is the best solution?
HYPOTHESIS 2: Do you believe this solution is the best for N&S reunification? Why or why not? Why is it better or not as good as the first essay?		
DOCUMENT C: <u>First Step to Reunify: Involve the Young</u>	SUMMARIZE: What is the author's proposed solution/s?	CLOSE READING: Why does the author believe this is the best solution?
HYPOTHESIS 3: Do you believe this solution is the best for N&S reunification? Why or why not? Why is it better or not as good as the first or second essay?		

COMING TO A CONSENSUS: WHAT IS THE BEST SOLUTION TO NORTH AND SOUTH KOREA REUNIFICATION?

Now that you have read three possible solutions for reunification you need to choose the best solution. You can either choose one of the author's solutions OR you can formulate your own solution using a hybrid of solutions from two or all three essays. Both choices must outline an argument using evidence from the essay/s, AND from your own knowledge of the North and South Korean conflict we have learned in class. Be sure to explain in detail why you believe this solution is better than any other.

A large, empty rectangular box with a thin black border, intended for the student to write their response to the prompt. The box occupies most of the lower half of the page.