SOCRATIC SEMINAR: RELIGION, PHILOSOPHY, AND POLITICAL POWER IN EAST ASIA

GRADES: High School

AUTHOR: Amy Swartz

SUBJECT: Advanced Placement World History

TIME REQUIRED: One eighty to ninety minute class or two forty-five minute class periods (with students completing portions of the lesson in addition to class time)

OBJECTIVES:
1. Evaluate the use of religion and philosophy by East Asian governments (China, Korea and Japan) in order to maintain power from 500-1500 CE.
2. Evaluate a speaker’s point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric. Present information, findings, and supporting evidence such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (Common Core Standard for Speaking and Listening)
3. Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text. (Common Core Standard for Reading)
4. Determine central ideas or themes of a text and analyze their development; summarize the key supporting details and ideas. (Common Core Standard for Reading)
5. Integrate and evaluate content presented in diverse formats and media, including visually and quantitatively, as well as in words. (Common Core Standard for Reading)
6. Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take. (Common Core Standard for Reading)
7. Read and comprehend complex literary and informational texts independently and proficiently. (Common Core Standard for Reading)
8. Prepare for and participate effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. (Common Core Standard for Speaking and Listening)
9. Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content. (Common Core Standard for Writing)
10. Write an essay applying the concept of political entities using religious or philosophical principles in order to acquire, reinforce, and maintain power from another part of the world, either as a current event or a historical example.

MATERIALS REQUIRED:
- Copies of Socratic seminar documents for each student (Handout 1)
- Copies of graphic organizer for student use in preparation for and during the Socratic seminar (Handout 3)
- Copies of Seminar Participant Reflection and Goals (Handout 2)
• One copy of the Paideia Seminar Process Script for the teacher
• Copies of seminar participation rubric (Handout 4)
• Copies of the post-seminar essay assignment and rubric (Handout 5)

BACKGROUND:
From 500-1500 CE, Confucianism, Taoism, Buddhism, and Shintoism greatly influenced the cultures of East Asian societies, particularly the political entities of China, and then Korea and Japan. Originating in China, the philosophies of Confucianism and Taoism became engrained in all aspects of Chinese life, from politics to education to social organization. Buddhism from India gained popularity in China during the fifth century. Due to China’s reciprocal connections with Korea and Japan, Buddhism, Confucianism, and Taoism, influenced these societies also, eventually blending in varying degrees with traditional shamanistic beliefs and Japanese Shintoism. The elites of China, Korea, and Japan utilized these belief systems in order to acquire, reinforce, and maintain their power. Common themes, such as, loyalty, balance, harmony with nature, respect for authority, hierarchical relationships, the divine right to rule, and the importance of education were expressed through the laws, poetry, art, and architecture of East Asian societies as evidence of the high political value of these belief systems.

The AP World History course requires student to address course themes and key concepts from the College Board’s curriculum framework. This lesson addresses the following themes: Theme 2: Development and Interaction of Cultures, Theme 3: State-Building, Expansion, and Conflict, and Theme 5: Development and Transformation of Social Structures. The key concepts related to this activity are reflected in the AP historical periodization for Period 2: Organization of Reorganization of Human Societies, c. 600 B.C.E to c. 600 C.E. and Period 3: Regional and Trans-regional Interactions, c. 600 C.E. to c. 1450 C.E.

The format used for the documents (Handout 1) is similar to that of an Advanced Placement Exams Documents Based Question (DBQ).

Students in my classes are familiar with the process used for Socratic seminars adapted from The National Paideia Center. A teacher, who may not be familiar with Socratic seminars, may find the resources from the National Paideia Center (http://www.paideia.org) useful in planning such a seminar.

PROCEDURE:
1. As a culminating activity to the students’ study of East Asia in the third unit of the AP World History Curriculum, they will begin preparing for a Socratic seminar discussion by reading the document packet (Handout 1) and individually beginning the completion of the graphic organizer (Handout 3). Students’ notes should be recorded next to each document, with main ideas compiled on the chart. This portion of the assignment should be given to students so they may complete the reading and graphic organizer as homework at least a few days before the scheduled seminar.
2. On the day of the seminar, students should arrange the classroom desks in a circle to facilitate discussion. Students need their document packet, graphic organizer, and the seminar participant reflection sheet (Handout 2). The teacher will need the same materials, in addition to the Seminar Process Script, and paper for taking notes.
throughout the seminar discussion. (I use two sheets of scrap paper; one to make a general list of key ideas or points to revisit or address, and the other to identify where each student sits in the circle to show connections and frequency of participation in the discussion. Lines are drawn showing connections as the conversation evolves to help me track if particular individuals are dominating, if some students are left out, or a small group begin to take over the discussion, in addition to the viewpoints being presented.) Copies of Handouts 4 and 5 should be made for distribution at the end of the class.

3. To begin preparation for the seminar, the instructor will review the definition and purpose of the seminar, the roles and expectations of the participants and facilitator from the Seminar Process Script. The class will set a group goal for the seminar based on past seminar experiences and areas in need of improvement. A group consensus should determine the most suitable common goal, which will be noted by the students at the top of their Seminar Participant Reflection sheet in the “Group Goal” area.

4. Next, students should consider personal participation goals on the Seminar Participant Reflection sheet and write their choice in the space provided in the section, “Before Seminar.”

5. The teacher/facilitator begins the seminar by asking all students to briefly share in round robin fashion one document and their analysis explaining their understanding of how East Asian governments’ used philosophy and religion in order to maintain power.

6. Following the opening round, students begin to present their conclusions, citing direct or inferred ideas from the documents to explain how philosophies and religions were used to maintain power. The teacher may interject a question or an idea for comment if necessary in order to promote discussion and to encourage all students to participate. Additionally, all documents must be used at least once during the course of the discussion.

7. As students converse, periodically remind them to record big ideas on their graphic organizer and to pause so students have a chance to record their thoughts before proceeding. Their charts should indicate how general themes, such as loyalty, respect for authority, the importance of harmony with nature, etc. were used to help political entities gain and/or maintain power. The teacher should record key aspects of the seminar discussion and how students used the documents for purposes of assessment. The seminar discussion should take about 60 to 70 minutes.

8. With about fifteen minutes remaining, segue to the post-seminar assignment by briefly asking students to apply the key ideas discussed throughout the seminar to another aspect of East Asian culture (other than politics), other cultures, current events, or even their own lives.

9. Distribute the post-seminar essay assignment and rubric for review (Handouts 4 and 5).

10. With about five minutes remaining in the class, asks the class to provide feedback regarding the group goal and to propose an area for improvement in the next seminar. With the remaining time students should self-assess their selected personal goal by completing and submitting the Seminar Participant Reflection Sheet.

11. The students complete the essay for homework. At the beginning of the next class meeting, ask 3-4 students to volunteer to summarize their essay to review the seminar and to explain how the concept was applied elsewhere in the world.

12. Students will submit their documents, graphic organizer, seminar participant reflection sheet, their essay, and the rubrics for grading.
**EVALUATION:**
Students will be assessed based on their ability to analyze the document collection in relation to how political entities used philosophy and religion to acquire, reinforce and maintain power. Evidence will be in the form of their document notes, graphic organizer, and their participation and contributions to the seminar discussion. Their post-seminar essay will also be assessed using a separate rubric.

**ENRICHMENT:**
Because this lesson is designed for advanced students, students in my classes would have practiced analysis of a variety of documents before assigning this activity as written, as students need to be able to analyze variety of documents independently. However, the assignment could be adapted to help build students’ skill sets in these areas. Teachers may need to provide a scaffolding tool to help students analyze the documents, such as, an APPARTS chart. Students use this mnemonic device to guide their analysis based on questions related to: authorship, place, prior knowledge, audience, reason the source was produced, the main idea, and significance. Students’ answers and evidence are recorded on the chart. Additionally, the teacher could facilitate students working with a partner or in small groups in order to complete the document analysis, followed by the large group Socratic seminar discussion.

The documents could also be used for a more traditional document-based essay question assignment, where the students write a response to the prompt using inferences derived from the documents.

**RESOURCES:**


HANDOUT 1: SOCRATIC SEMINAR: RELIGION, PHILOSOPHY, AND POLITICS IN EAST ASIA

Read and analyze the following ten documents in preparation for a Socratic seminar. Use the graphic organizer chart (Handout 3) to record your ideas.

In addition your knowledge of East Asian history from c. 500- c.1500 CE, use these documents to analyze the East Asian governments’ use of philosophy and religion in order to acquire, reinforce, and maintain power.

DOCUMENTS

Document 1
Source: “The Transfer Ceremony at the Ise Shrine” (1847 – 1852) is a Woodblock print by artist Utagawa Kuniyoshi. Ise Grand Shrine dedicated to goddess Amaterasu-ōmikami, a Shinto goddess of the sun and universe. The Emperor of Japan is believed to be a direct descendent of Amaterasu.
It is stated in the Book of Kuan-tzu\(^1\) [Guan Zi]: “the method by which a sage rules the world is this: he does not let the four classes of people live together. Therefore, there are no complaints, and things run smoothly. As a result, scholars know how to spend their leisure, laborers abide with the orders of officials, merchants go to the marketplaces and farmers go to the fields. Everyone goes to his appropriate place and lives there satisfactorily. Young children are sent to study; their wills are satisfied and they do not change their minds when they see strange things.” The Kuan-tzu Book further states: “Children of scholars and farmers must always be scholars and farmers and children of merchants and laborers must also always be merchants and laborers, so that a scholar can give instructions and take care of his proper status, and a farmer can work attentively in cultivating his crops to feed the people. Everyone is satisfied with his occupation and does not seek to change. This is truly good! Otherwise, hundreds of laborers might all go to the marketplaces and ten thousand merchants might all try to work in the same [most profitable] business; they would all become cunning, deceitful, eager to play tricks, and they would also become capricious, greedy and seek only profits.”

Now, to fit people in their occupations is not to improve morals. To see something better and change—what harm is there in this? Take the example of Tuan-mu [Duamu] who became a merchant [after being a disciple of Confucius], Chiao Li [Jiao Li] who became a fisherman [after being an important official] and Wang Meng who went to sell dust-baskets [after being a prime minister]; these men responded to their times and changed in myriad ways, why should they have been restricted to their fixed occupations? Similarly, Huang Hsien [Huang Xian] was originally a lowly veterinarian, Sang Hung-yang [Sang Hongyang] a merchant, Sun Shu-ao a woodcutter, and yet they all were able to preserve their intelligence and help strengthen their states. How can we accuse them of responding to their times and of going to take up responsibilities other than their own occupations! We now have a regulation keeping the descendants of those in despised occupations from taking the civil service examinations. Although this rule has been in force for some time, I consider that it still is a good time to examine this regulation. You candidates have excelled yourselves in knowledge of the past, and in debating various problems; I would like you to spend time considering the issue I have just outlined above.

\(^1\) Kuan-tzu or Master Kuan [Guan], who lived in the middle of the seventh century BC., is regarded in Chinese history as one of the most innovative government reformers in ancient China. He was a great supporter of a centralized form of government.

Document 3
Source: Tomb of King Sejong the Great (r. 1418-1450) King Sejong, used Confucian policies and was known for the creation of Hangul, the Korean alphabet, as well as, many scientific and technological advances.

Document 4
Source: Excerpt from The Ten Injunctions of Wang Kŏn (r.918-943) founder of the Koryŏ Dynasty

Temples and monasteries were newly opened and built upon the sites chosen by Monk Tosŏn according to the principles of geomancy. He said: ‘If temples and monasteries are indiscriminately built at locations not chosen by me, the terrestrial force and energy will be sapped and damaged, hastening the decline of the dynasty.’ I am greatly concerned that the royal family, the aristocracy, and the courtiers all may build many temples and monasteries in the future in order to seek Buddha’s blessings. In the last days of Silla many temples were capriciously built. As a result, the terrestrial force and energy were wasted and diminished, causing its demise. Vigilantly guard against this.

Emperor Shomu (701-756) announced to his court the reasons for the founding of a great temple dedicated to the Vairocana Buddha of the Kegon sect:

Our fervent desire is that under the aegis of the Three Treasures, the benefits of peace may be brought to all in heaven and on earth, even animals and plants sharing in its fruits, for all time to come.... We take this occasion to proclaim Our great vow for erecting an image of Locana Buddha [Vairocana] in gold and copper. We wish to make the utmost use of the nation’s resources of metal in the casting of this image, and also to level off the high hill on which the great edifice is to be raised, so that the entire land may be joined with Us in the fellowship of Buddhism and enjoy in common the advantages which this undertaking affords of the attainment of Buddhahood.

Document 6

Source; Sijo (an ancient Korean verse form traditionally containing 3 lines of 14-16 syllables each, for a total of 44-46) by Sŏng Sammun, 1418-1456.

Sŏng Sammun was a prominent Confucian scholar and member of the Korean Royal Academy during the reign of King Sejong of the Chosŏn kingdom. As Cultural Minister, he presided over the creation of Hangul, the Korean alphabet. Previously, Koreans had used a laborious script based on Chinese characters. The new alphabet of 28 characters (later reduced to 26) was based on the unique phonetic characteristics of the spoken Korean language. Published by King Sejong as a Royal Decree in 1446, Hangul revolutionized the writing of Korean literature and inspired a renaissance of Korean culture. When King Sejong died, Tanjong, the legitimate heir known as The Boy King, was ousted in a coup by his uncle. Sŏng was suspected of plotting to restore the deposed heir and was put to death, along with his father, three brothers, four sons and five colleagues. It is said that he wrote this verse while being transported to his execution. It is still recited by school children.

When my bones have bleached and blended
What new life will come to me?
I shall be a towering pine
at the top of Mt. Diamond. *
Between snow white home and heaven
I'll stand tall and ever green.

*The Korean word used here, Pongnae-san, freely translated as Fairyland of Foliage, is an affectionate summer name for the Diamond Mountains, a prominent feature in both the Korean landscape and poetry. The winter name of the mountains is Koegel, translated as All Bones or Bleached Bones, as in line 1. Indigenous trees such as the pine also figure prominently in sijo on both literal and figurative levels.

Document 7
Source: Excerpt from The Reform Edict of Taika, 646 CE

Let the following be abolished: the titles held by imperial princes to serfs granted by imperial decrees (koshiro); the titles to lands held directly by the imperial court (miyake); and private titles to lands and workers held by ministers and functionaries (omi, muraji and tomo no miyatsuko) of the court, by local nobles (kuni no miyatsuko), and by village chiefs (mura no obito). In lieu thereof, sustenance households¹ " shall be granted to those of the rank of Daibu (Chief of a bureau or of a ward) and upwards on a scale corresponding to their positions. Cloth and silk stuffs shall be given to the lower officials and people, varying in value. It is said that the duty of the Daibu is to govern the people. If they discharge their task diligently, the people will have trust in them. Therefore it is for the benefit of the people that the revenue of the Daibu shall be increased.

¹ The term “sustenance households” refers to a certain number of households that were assigned to the officials in place of the serfs taken from them. Generally, taxes remitted by these households became personal income of the officials. The rights to the households hereditary.


Document 8
Source: South Korean artist Kim Hongdo, or Tanwŏn’s (1745–c. 1806) late 18th century painting of “Sŏdang”, a private village school where young boys studied Confucian classics and other Chinese works during the Koryŏ (938-1392) and Chosŏn (1392-1948) Dynasties.
Document 9

Source: Tang Daizong on *The Art of Government*, founder of the Tang Dynasty (618-907 CE). He sets the tone for his new administration to his chosen officials.

During the Sui dynasty, all officials, in the central as well as the local governments, adopted an attitude of conformity to the general trend in order to be amiable and agreeable with one another. The result was disaster as all of you well know. Most of them did not understand the importance of dissent and comforted themselves by saying that as long as they did not disagree, they could forestall harm to themselves that might otherwise cross their path. When the government, as well as their families, finally collapsed in a massive upheaval, they were severely but justifiably criticized by their contemporaries for their complacency and inertia, even if they themselves may have been fortunate enough to escape death through a combination of circumstances.…

I want you to know that I am different. The empire is large and its population enormous. There are thousands of matters to be taken care of, each of which has to be closely coordinated with the others in order to bring about maximum benefit.…

I want you to know that whenever an imperial decree is handed down you should carefully study its content and decide for yourselves whether all or part of it is or is not wise or feasible. If you have any reservations, postpone the enforcement and petition to me immediately. You can do no less as my loyal ministers.

Governing a country is like taking care of a patient. The better the patient feels, the more he should be looked after, lest in a moment of complacency and neglect one irrevocably reverse the recovery process and send him to death. Likewise, when a country has only recently recovered from chaos and war, those responsible for running the country should be extremely diligent in their work, for false pride and self-indulgence will inevitably return the country to where it used to be and perhaps make it worse.

I realize that the safety of this nation relies to a great extent on what I can or may do and consequently I have not relaxed for a moment in doing the best I can. But I cannot do it alone. You gentlemen are my eyes and ears, legs and arms, and should do your best to assist me. If anything goes wrong anywhere in the empire, you should let me know immediately. If there is less than total trust between you and me and consequently you and I cannot do the best we can, the nation will suffer enormous damage.

Source: “Enjoying the Sun Beneath Pine Trees” by Ma Lin (ca. 1180-1256), of the Southern Sung (1127-1279). The Taoist philosophy, with its emphasis on nature, was fundamental to the early development of landscape painting and nature poetry in China.

**HANDOUT 2: SEMINAR PARTICIPANT REFLECTION**

**Group Goal:**

Name: ____________________  
Date: ____________________  
Period: ___

Text ____________________________________________

**BEFORE SEMINAR**

View the participation goals listed in the box at the bottom of the page. Then select and record one goal in the space below.

- For today’s seminar, my participation goal is to:

**AFTER SEMINAR**

Record a response to each prompt below.

- How often (or to what extent) did you attain your goal during today’s seminar? Circle one.
  - Never/ Not at All  
  - Sometimes/ Somewhat  
  - Always/ Completely


- For the next seminar, my goal will be to:

---

**Personal Participation Goals**

**DEVELOPING**

- Look at speaker  
- Refrain from talking while speaker is addressing class  
- Speak voluntarily at least twice  
- Speak loudly enough that everyone can hear me  
- Use others’ names  
- Share talk time  
- Make clear, accurate statements  
- Refer to text  
- Ask a question

**ADVANCED**

- Speak using relevant vocabulary and standard grammar  
- Refer to text and other relevant sources  
- Take notes on discussion  
- Comment on positive/negative implications of topic  
- Test assumptions and explore inferences  
- Consider multiple points of view  
- Acknowledge personal bias  
- Acknowledge changes in my own perspective  
- Add global/holistic interpretation to previous statement

---

**Paideia**

**Active Learning**
HANDOUT 3: GRAPHIC ORGANIZER

*Chinese, Korean, and Japanese Governments’ Utilization of Philosophy and Religion to Maintain Power*

**LEQ:** How did East Asian governments’ use philosophy and religion in order to maintain power?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>China</th>
<th>Korea</th>
<th>Japan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tang Dynasty 618-907</td>
<td>Unified Silla 676-936</td>
<td>Asuka 645-710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Song Dynasty 960-1279</td>
<td>Koryŏ Dynasty 938-1392</td>
<td>Nara 710-794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chosŏn Dynasty – 1392-1948</td>
<td>Heian 794-1185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kamakura 1185-1333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buddhism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confucianism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daoism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shinto</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**HANDOUT 4: SEMINAR RUBRIC**

**Socratic Seminar: Religion, Philosophy, and Politics in East Asia**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4=Advanced</th>
<th>3=Proficient</th>
<th>2=Basic</th>
<th>1=Below Basic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Criteria</strong></td>
<td><strong>Point Value</strong></td>
<td><strong>Student’s Score</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Documents and Graphic Organizer Chart**

1. Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cited specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text. (Common Core Standard for Reading)  
   - 1-4

2. Determined central ideas or themes of a text and analyze their development; summarized the key supporting details and ideas. (Common Core Standard for Reading)  
   - 1-4

3. Integrated and evaluated content presented in diverse formats and media, including visually and quantitatively, as well as in words. (Common Core Standard for Reading)  
   - 1-4

4. Analyzed how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take. (Common Core Standard for Reading)  
   - 1-4

5. Read and comprehended complex literary and informational texts independently and proficiently. (Common Core Standard for Reading)  
   - 1-4

**Seminar**

6. Prepared for and participated effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. (Common Core Standard for Speaking and Listening)  
   - 1-4 x 2

7. Evaluated a speaker’s point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric. Presented information, findings, and supporting evidence such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (Common Core Standard for Speaking and Listening)  
   - 1-4 x 2

8. Completed Seminar Participant Reflection (Handout 2)  
   - 1-4

**Post-seminar essay score from rubric** (Handout 5)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>FINAL SCORE</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
HANDOUT 5: POST-SEMINAR ESSAY ASSIGNMENT AND RUBRIC

Socratic Seminar: Religion, Philosophy, and Politics in East Asia

From the documents and seminar, use your understanding of how East Asian governments used philosophy and religion to maintain power in order to explain how this concept was applied elsewhere. You have two essay options:

1. Write a one-page essay using a historical example from another area of the world (Europe, the Middle East, Africa, or the Americas) to explain how political entities used religious or philosophical principles to maintain and reinforce power.
2. Write a one-page essay using a current event in Asia or another part of the world to explain how political entities use religious or philosophical principles to maintain and reinforce power.

Post-Seminar Journal Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Point Value</th>
<th>Student’s Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student writes informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content. (Common Core Standard for Writing)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student identifies in a thesis the time period, location, political entity and religious/philosophical principle used to maintain or reinforce power.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student cites at least two specific pieces of evidence (similar to the documents, such as, laws, literature, poetry, art, architecture, or other data) to support their thesis.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student explains how each piece of evidence related to the religious entity maintained or reinforced the power of the political entity.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student explains the degree of success or failure by the political entity in its attempt to maintain or reinforce its power.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal entry is one page and follows class criteria for formatting and grammar.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FINAL SCORE